

MAYOR SMITH FORCED TWINING "BOBTAIL" TRANSIT PLAN ON CITY, TAYLOR CHARGES

CONNELLY CALLS HALT ON TWINING'S SCHEME TO TAX SUBURBANITES

City Solicitor Advises Transit Head That His Plan to Finance Transit Lines Is Illegal

CITES COURT DECISIONS

City Solicitor Connelly, in an opinion sent to Director Twining last yesterday, advised him that the proposal to tax outlying sections is unconstitutional and impractical from a legal standpoint.

"First. After carefully weighing my words, that Mayor Smith insisted the City Hall section of the Broad street subway be shifted from its present location under City Hall, which was designated by the Department of City Transit, and which was found necessary by the State Public Service Commission to be proper for the safety, convenience, and safety of the public.

"Second. That the new location of the City Hall section of the Broad street subway around the westerly side of the City Hall, as designated in Mr. Twining's report, makes necessary the curtailment of the City Hall section of the Broad street subway from a four-track structure, because it is impossible to get the required curvature for four tracks from the new location into South Broad street at South Penn Square.

"Third. That this curtailment of the City Hall section of the Broad street subway made necessary radical changes in the city's plans for transit development, and that the proposed changes will greatly and seriously impair the usefulness of the high-speed system to the citizens of Philadelphia.

"Fourth. That Mr. Twining, as consulting engineer of the Department of City Transit, frequently has assured me there is no risk in building the four-track structure and station designed beneath the City Hall, he still was firmly of that opinion, notwithstanding the statement made by him in that report, which was submitted yesterday, that one of his original recommendations was the curtailment of the City Hall section of the Broad street line with station, in liability of damage to the City Hall.

"That H. H. Quimby, chief engineer of the Department of City Transit, while planning the four-track subway structure with station beneath the City Hall, assured me on several occasions the construction of that section as designed would not be dangerous in the slightest degree, and that he was still firmly of that opinion on January 1, 1916.

"The construction of the four-track section of the Broad street subway and transfer station beneath the City Hall as originally recommended is essential to the entire plan of transit development, and to eliminate the four-track City Hall station section would serve no useful public purpose.

"The Twining plan, in my opinion, is vitally defective in the following respects: "First. A four-track subway structure is provided for in Broad street between Erie and Ridge avenues, with a two-track structure extending from Ridge avenue down Broad street to Spruce, and a two-track subway structure extending down Broad street from Spruce to Walnut, without any track connection with the Broad street subway at Broad and Walnut streets, which is on a lower level than the Broad street subway.

"Thus the provision made in the original plan for a continuation of the four-track subway from North Broad street down to Spruce street is abandoned, where the two additional tracks are most needed to make effective express service feasible, between outlying districts served by the Broad street subway and the City Hall section, and between North and South Philadelphia.

"The absence of a track connection between the Broad street subway and the subway under Walnut street would, for all times, deprive the people of South Philadelphia of the privilege of reaching points served by the subway under Walnut street, and the City Hall section, throughout the business district, without change of cars and stair climbing, at Mr. Twining's proposed station at Broad and Walnut streets.

"I believe that the privilege which is to be accorded passengers from North Philadelphia of traveling either directly through south on Broad street or indirectly by way of Ridge avenue, 8th and Walnut streets, without change of cars, should be accorded the people of South Philadelphia.

"The building of a two-track subway structure in Broad street between Ridge avenue and Spruce street instead of a four-track structure makes it impossible to bring the Parkway-North 29th street-Roxborough line into the west side of the delivery loop at City Hall station, from which point, under the original plan, the Parkway trains would be routed through to either South Philadelphia; or south, under Broad street, to Locust; east, under Arch, and north, under Broad, returning by the same route.

"Under Mr. Twining's plan the Parkway-North 29th street-Roxborough trains would be routed in through the Parkway, to 16th, south on 16th to Walnut, east on Walnut to 8th, thence under 8th to Broad street, and north on Broad street, returning by the same route.

"Under the original plan the Woodland avenue elevated line was to be connected temporarily with the Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and trains were to be operated through by way of Market street from Darby to Frankford or Camden until the Market street subway reached its capacity when the Chestnut street subway would in any event be necessary as a relief line to connect up the Frankford and Darby elevated lines through the business district.

"Every one who has studied the subject admits that the present Market street line will reach its capacity in less than 10 years unless it be straightened beneath the City Hall and the platforms be lengthened, in which event its capacity would be increased about 20 per cent.

"The foregoing I believe to be glaring and vital defects in Mr. Twining's design of those facilities which would form the very foundation of our municipal transit system.

"The Department of City Transit selected Arch street as the proper location for the north side of the delivery loop because of the necessity of building a four-track subway in Broad street, from Spruce street, for the reasons stated in the report, and it seemed advisable to make full use of these four tracks down to Arch street by placing the north side of the delivery loop under Arch street, instead of under Ridge avenue. The Arch street location, in my opinion, gives better delivery for passengers, and it affords ready access between the Reading Terminal and the subway system at the station designed to be located at 12th and Arch streets beneath the Reading Terminal.

"The Department of City Transit selected Locust street as the proper location for the south side of the delivery loop because it was impossible to locate the south side of the delivery loop in Walnut street, with the necessary track connections with the Broad street subway, without grade crossings at Broad and Walnut streets, without forfeiting the station which is designed to extend under Broad street from Chestnut street to Walnut street; I believe this station to be a necessity.

"Under the Twining plan the south side of the loop is placed under Walnut street, and the necessary track connections between the Walnut street subway and the Broad street subway are abandoned.

"The department recommended that the Woodland avenue elevated line be brought in preferably by connecting it with the present Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and in the event of failure on the part of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company to make the proper provision for the through routing of the Woodland avenue and Frankford trains by way of the present Market street elevated line, it was recommended that the Woodland avenue line and the Frankford line be connected by a Chestnut street subway to be built by the city.

"These two elevated lines, if operated through Chestnut street, would seriously compete with the existing system, and for this reason a fair agreement between the city and the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company should be secured providing for the through operation of the Frankford and Woodland avenue trains by way of the present Market street elevated line.

"Under Mr. Twining's plan the city would forfeit that strategic position which it has gained and which will require the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company to operate the Frankford and Woodland avenue lines through Chestnut street, until it reaches capacity and the Chestnut street subway is built.

"Mr. Twining proposes as step No. 1 to build the Frankford elevated, connecting it with the existing Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, permitting the Frankford line to be through-routed with the present Market street line.

"He proposes as step No. 2 to build the North Broad street subway from a point near Erie avenue, on the north, to Ridge avenue, on the south, with one pair of tracks extending south along Ridge street to a point near Spruce street, and one pair of tracks turning east along Ridge avenue to 8th street, south on 8th street to Walnut and west on Walnut to a point near 16th street.

"It would be impossible to get an independent operator to equip and operate these lines embodied in steps one and two, in competition with the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, and Mr. Twining proposes to recognize that fact, for he proposes that no more construction than is now authorized be undertaken until it is definitely known by whom the entire system is to be operated and on what terms.

"The only construction now authorized is the City Hall station section of the Broad street subway between South Penn square and Filbert street, and the Frankford elevated between Chestnut street and Bridge street; for the latter terminal facilities will soon be required, and must be obtained by the city upon fair terms, regardless of the attitude of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company.

"It is an amazing proposition that the city of Philadelphia shall stop the construction of the Broad street subway, and of its other high-speed lines and await the pleasure of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company in making an agreement for their equipment and operation. The proper course to pursue is to proceed with the construction of the facilities which are essential to the proper service and accommodation of the people of Philadelphia, and designed in a manner which will enable them to be equipped and operated either by the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company or in competition with the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, then there will be no difficulty about getting a proper agreement between the company and the city.

"I fully agree with Mr. Twining that the prices of labor and material are at the time abnormally and excessively high, and that it would be very unwise and unnecessary to award very large contracts at

two-track through the business district from Federal street north of insufficient capacity to handle the trains from both the two-track line leading to League Island and the two-track line leading from Broad and Federal streets to the southwestern section of West Philadelphia.

"The people served by the future extension into southwestern West Philadelphia will be deprived of direct delivery throughout the business district without change of cars at Broad and Walnut streets.

"Under the original plan the Woodland avenue elevated line was to be connected temporarily with the Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and trains were to be operated through by way of Market street from Darby to Frankford or Camden until the Market street subway reached its capacity when the Chestnut street subway would in any event be necessary as a relief line to connect up the Frankford and Darby elevated lines through the business district.

"Every one who has studied the subject admits that the present Market street line will reach its capacity in less than 10 years unless it be straightened beneath the City Hall and the platforms be lengthened, in which event its capacity would be increased about 20 per cent.

"The foregoing I believe to be glaring and vital defects in Mr. Twining's design of those facilities which would form the very foundation of our municipal transit system.

"The Department of City Transit selected Arch street as the proper location for the north side of the delivery loop because of the necessity of building a four-track subway in Broad street, from Spruce street, for the reasons stated in the report, and it seemed advisable to make full use of these four tracks down to Arch street by placing the north side of the delivery loop under Arch street, instead of under Ridge avenue. The Arch street location, in my opinion, gives better delivery for passengers, and it affords ready access between the Reading Terminal and the subway system at the station designed to be located at 12th and Arch streets beneath the Reading Terminal.

"The Department of City Transit selected Locust street as the proper location for the south side of the delivery loop because it was impossible to locate the south side of the delivery loop in Walnut street, with the necessary track connections with the Broad street subway, without grade crossings at Broad and Walnut streets, without forfeiting the station which is designed to extend under Broad street from Chestnut street to Walnut street; I believe this station to be a necessity.

"Under the Twining plan the south side of the loop is placed under Walnut street, and the necessary track connections between the Walnut street subway and the Broad street subway are abandoned.

"The department recommended that the Woodland avenue elevated line be brought in preferably by connecting it with the present Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and in the event of failure on the part of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company to make the proper provision for the through routing of the Woodland avenue and Frankford trains by way of the present Market street elevated line, it was recommended that the Woodland avenue line and the Frankford line be connected by a Chestnut street subway to be built by the city.

"These two elevated lines, if operated through Chestnut street, would seriously compete with the existing system, and for this reason a fair agreement between the city and the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company should be secured providing for the through operation of the Frankford and Woodland avenue trains by way of the present Market street elevated line.

"Under Mr. Twining's plan the city would forfeit that strategic position which it has gained and which will require the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company to operate the Frankford and Woodland avenue lines through Chestnut street, until it reaches capacity and the Chestnut street subway is built.

"Mr. Twining proposes as step No. 1 to build the Frankford elevated, connecting it with the existing Market street elevated line at 30th and Market streets, and the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, permitting the Frankford line to be through-routed with the present Market street line.

"He proposes as step No. 2 to build the North Broad street subway from a point near Erie avenue, on the north, to Ridge avenue, on the south, with one pair of tracks extending south along Ridge street to a point near Spruce street, and one pair of tracks turning east along Ridge avenue to 8th street, south on 8th street to Walnut and west on Walnut to a point near 16th street.

"It would be impossible to get an independent operator to equip and operate these lines embodied in steps one and two, in competition with the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, and Mr. Twining proposes to recognize that fact, for he proposes that no more construction than is now authorized be undertaken until it is definitely known by whom the entire system is to be operated and on what terms.

"The only construction now authorized is the City Hall station section of the Broad street subway between South Penn square and Filbert street, and the Frankford elevated between Chestnut street and Bridge street; for the latter terminal facilities will soon be required, and must be obtained by the city upon fair terms, regardless of the attitude of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company.

"It is an amazing proposition that the city of Philadelphia shall stop the construction of the Broad street subway, and of its other high-speed lines and await the pleasure of the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company in making an agreement for their equipment and operation. The proper course to pursue is to proceed with the construction of the facilities which are essential to the proper service and accommodation of the people of Philadelphia, and designed in a manner which will enable them to be equipped and operated either by the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company or in competition with the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company, then there will be no difficulty about getting a proper agreement between the company and the city.

"I do not wish to go into too much detail at this time, as I shall probably have more to say later.

"I want to remind everyone that no part of the interest on the bonds issued for transit development will be payable out of current revenues by the city until one year after the facilities are actually in operation and certain revenues. Therefore, the transit loan could have no effect whatever on the tax rate for four or five years in any event, no matter what any one says.

"I want to remind the citizens of Philadelphia that the saving to them due to the elimination of the exchange ticket will be over \$300,000 a year, while the annual saving to them, time calculated on a basis of 15 cents per hour, will be, in 1920, \$1,655,000.

"As a result of the deliberate and careful study of the subject of the transit system, I regret to say that I am forced to the conclusion that those plans are admirably calculated to benefit the citizens of Philadelphia in the future.

"I cannot agree with Mr. Twining's report and the plans which he recommends, I regret to say that I am forced to the conclusion that those plans are admirably calculated to benefit the citizens of Philadelphia in the future.

"I cannot go into further detail at this time, excepting to state that the four tracks in Broad street, and the central transfer station beneath the City Hall, are essential to the welfare of the traveling public in Philadelphia, and that no one objection which has been urged against them is not needed on the part of the Broad street subway has any force whatever.

"That station was designed to ultimately have outlets from under ground on the south pavement of South Penn square, both east and west of Broad street, in the west pavements of West Penn square, in Broad Street Station, at various points in the sidewalk around the outside of City Hall, and in the City Hall courtyard.

"These plans were not referred to by Mr. Twining. They are on file in the Department of City Transit. If they are carried out no congestion need be feared in the City Hall and passengers will be properly distributed.

"It should be remembered that the so-called 'Taylor plan' provides for through-routing and only such North Broad street trains as are not needed on the line through routing with North Broad street will be turned back on the North Broad street line directly by way of the delivery loop.

"The so-called 'Taylor plan' provides for the following routing of trains: From North Broad street to Arch street, then by way of the delivery loop, down Arch street to 8th, down 8th to Locust, up Locust to Broad, down Broad to League Island, and return.

From North Broad street directly through to League Island and return.

From South Broad street to City Hall station, thence out to the Parkway-North 29th street-Roxborough line and return.

From South Broad street directly through to North Broad street and return.

From South Broad street around the delivery loop and return.

From Roxborough to City Hall station, thence south to Locust street, around the delivery loop and north on Broad street and return.

From Darby, by way of Market street elevated-subway and Frankford elevated to Frankford and return.

From South Broad street terminal by way of Market street elevated-subway and Frankford elevated to Frankford and return.

From the completion of the Camden tube a portion of the Darby and 69th street trains would be routed through to Camden.

From Frankford the Frankford trains would be routed through by way of Market street to Darby and to 69th street Terminal and return.

All of the plans of the department were drawn to afford the greatest amount of through-routing possible, and the greatest facility for passengers to transfer between surface lines and high-speed lines and between any two high-speed lines at all points of intersection.

The removal of the City Hall station to Broad and Arch streets, virtually will prevent the free transfer of passengers between the Market street subway-elevated line and the Broad street subway line.

The people of West Philadelphia who now wish to travel between West Philadelphia and many points in either the northern or southern section of the city have to pay an extra fare to do so. Under the contemplated plan it looks as if they would have to continue to pay that extra fare.

Likewise, people in South Philadelphia, wishing to reach many points in Philadelphia, now have to pay an extra fare to do so. If the City Hall station be removed it is likely that they will continue to pay that extra fare.

It is time for the citizens of Philadelphia to come forward and assert their rights in this matter. If they fail to do it will not be because I have not informed them of their peril.

Baby Dies in Mother's Absence Mrs. Lena Foraker, of 2533 South Fairhill street, left her 7-month-old baby, Allen, in a perambulator outside of her home last night for a few moments, and when she returned the child was dead. A physician said the infant had suddenly been seized with convulsions.

New Four-story Home for Bank Contractors are estimating on a new bank building at 1211-13 Chestnut street for the Legal Trust Company. The structure, 37 by 95 feet, will be four stories high, built of brick and stone. Bunting & Shrigley are the architects.



HORACE V. MACFAYDEN Chairman of the All-Philadelphia Transit League, who demands the resignation of Transit Director Twining.

BRITISH BLOCKADE NET MADE TIGHTER

All Ships Violating Rules Subject to Seizure, New Order Declares

LONDON, March 31.—The British blockade that has been tightened by the Order in Council issued last night, which declares that "neither a vessel nor her cargo shall be immune from capture for a breach of blockade upon the sole ground that she at the moment is on her way to a non-blockaded port."

The order sets forth that, subject to certain modifications and omissions, the Government has put in force the Declaration of London respecting the capture of merchant craft during the war.

Certain doubts, however, have arisen concerning the right to effect "the capture of conditional contraband on board a vessel bound to a neutral port," and these doubts it is declared "expedient to put an end to." Hence it has been decided no longer to adopt article 15 of the Declaration, which provides that "whatever may be the ultimate destination of a vessel or of her cargo she cannot be captured for breach of blockade if at the moment she is on her way to a non-blockaded port."

It is therefore ordered that the provisions of the Declaration of London shall not be deemed to limit, or to be limited, in any way the right of His Majesty, in accordance with the law of nations, to capture goods upon the ground that they are conditional contraband, nor to affect, or to have affected, the liability of conditional contraband to capture, whether the carriage of the goods to their destination be direct or entailed transshipment or subsequent transport by land.

This provision is made applicable also to absolute contraband. Another clause says that enemy destination "may be presumed to exist if the goods are consigned to a person who during the present hostilities has forwarded imported contraband goods to territories belonging to or occupied by the enemy."

Garrett Hill Boys Entertain Twenty-five members of the Garrett Hill Boys' Club, of which Samuel Scoville, the Bryn Mawr lawyer and naturalist is director, entertained a big audience last night in the Bryn Mawr firehouse with a minstrel and vaudeville show. Andrew A. Riley was the interlocutor and the end men were Charles Baker, William Chapman, Thomas Norton and John Maguire. Other participants were Joseph Glane, Joseph Smith, J. Ignatius Kirach, John Powers, William Brown, George McHugh, William Devereux and George Coane.

TWINING SHOULD QUIT AT ONCE, SAYS LEADER OF TRANSIT LEAGUE

Horace V. MacFayden Asserts Director's Usefulness as City Official Is Ended

"Director Twining's usefulness as a city official is ended. He should resign at once!"

Such was the observation and demand of Horace V. MacFayden, chairman of the All-Philadelphia Rapid Transit League, at his home in Lyceum avenue, Roxborough this morning.

"Every toiler should unite in a demand that he be fired at once unless he goes into voluntary retirement," continued Mr. MacFayden. "I was after a five-hour study of the essential features of the report and recommendations presented to Council's Finance Committee by Mr. Taylor's former assistant and his successor, that Mr. MacFayden spoke.

"Ever since I can remember there has been a demand for the elimination of the 5-cent exchange ticket and a desire to force legislation that would insure a uniform 5-cent fare," said he. "Yet in spite of the agitation of years, Mr. Twining calmly suggests and recommends an increase in fare to \$25,000,000 persons and puts himself on the back for advising that \$30,000,000 more persons be mulcted for \$300,000 by the exchange ticket tax, that this is to continue for something like 40 or 50 years and run up a greater total with the increase of the city's population.

"Mr. Twining asks us to allow the P. R. T. to continue the sale or exchange tickets which bring in \$30,000 a year, and that we are then to pay seven-twentieths of a cent more on each of the \$25,000,000 rides that have been absolutely a straight nickel increase in fare to \$25,000,000 persons annually, an excess that would amortize the original projected \$50,000,000 loan in 25 years.

"He would have us spend \$35,000,000 for a patch system, but throws up his hands in horror at the thought of spending \$50,000,000. The difference would amount to \$15,000,000 interest in a year at 5 per cent, or about \$14,062 per ward. On these figures."



Advertisement for Bedford Mineral Water, featuring a circular logo with the text 'SINCE 1804 A DAILY WATER TREATMENT BEDFORD MINERAL WATER FOR THE LIVER, KIDNEYS AND STOMACH'.

Advertisement for Bedford Mineral Water with the headline 'When You're Well Keep Well!' and a bottle of the product.

TAYLOR ASSAILS BOBTAIL PROGRAM

Continued from Page One Denied Taylor's charge that Mayor Smith is responsible for defeating the transit plans changes which Mr. Taylor says give the Rapid Transit Company a strange hold on the city and block transit development.

"No corporations nor any one, directly or indirectly, have any power over our Mayor," declared Vare. "I have felt from the start of the transit matter that no matter what the people want they will get it. I have not changed my mind.

"I always agreed with former Director Taylor and always followed every proposition he had for transit, but I know that he is absolutely wrong in saying that the Mayor ordered the changes and not Director Twining. I feel that Mr. Taylor knows this, too, despite his statement.

"I have always helped Mr. Taylor, and have always been at the head and front of Taylor's proposition when he could not get the other leaders interested in his plans. If he tells the truth he will have to say so. There has been every effort made to make political capital out of the transit question, when it should have been discussed upon the ground of merit alone.

"I said at the beginning that the Mayor will be with the people, and I still say so.

Among business, civic and improvement organizations throughout the city the opinion was freely expressed today that the \$5,500,000 loan would be defeated at the polls unless the Smith Administration withdraws its support from the Twining proposals and keeps faith with the people.

The statement from former Director Taylor follows: TAYLOR'S STATEMENT. "A careful study of Mr. Twining's suggested changes in the city's plans for transit development discloses the fact that adoption of these changes will seriously and permanently curtail the sphere of usefulness of the city's high-speed transit system and prevent the city from providing necessary transit facilities for the proper service of the people in the future.

PETEY—"Hark!" Is Right But Not the "Gentle Footsteps"

Large cartoon illustration at the bottom of the page showing a man smoking a pipe and another man talking to him. The man with the pipe says, 'Now Uncle Petey, please try and do your next scene right—oh dear, everything has gone wrong so far with the play and do better.' The man with the pipe replies, 'Aw, I got the next scene down pat—don't worry Mabel.' The man with the pipe says, 'Sa-ay-nix on the soft coal, no smoking allowed.' The man with the pipe says, 'Well, I'm the hero and I must be smoking as I enter.' The man with the pipe says, 'Aw, run away—I'm the hero, I guess I can smoke if I want.' The man with the pipe says, 'The marster doesn't seem to be himself since he'llie went away—hark—I hear his gentle footsteps now.'